

Remarks

Applicant has canceled claims 1-15 and is presenting new claims 16-35, to better define the claimed invention. It is believed that these changes do not add new subject matter to the application.

While the patent to Chao and international application to Baru and the present invention use similar terms to describe the various elements of each device, the terms are not similarly defined. Further, the patent to Chao and the international application to Baru are complete integrated workstations which are designed to stand on their own. Quite the opposite is true for the present invention which is not self supporting, is not useful independent of an office chair and is intended as an attachment to another piece of furniture.

In the patent to Chao and the international application to Baru the term "chair" is in fact a seat which is attached to a frame and can not be used without attachment to the frame. Further, the term chassis refers to a frame on which is mounted a desk and a seat. The frame in these references is the main support for each device without which neither the desk or chair are useful.

In the present invention the term "chair" refers to a self supporting independently useful article. It is upon this chair that the chassis is attached. The chassis of the present invention has a means of attachment to a chair, and a desk of which it supports. Here the chassis and desk is unusable without the chair to support the chassis.

The patent to Chao describes an integrated chair desk system, wherein the chair of the system may not act independently

or support a person without the chassis. The chassis in Chao and the present invention are completely different structures. Chao's chassis is designed as the central platform to which a chair and a desk are attached. Neither of which may be used without the chassis. The instant invention is attached to a stand alone chair having a single support column.

The instant invention and the Chao patent are not in fact similar in function. Chao has sliding thimbles 4 and 5 which connect to the chassis and utilize the chassis as a primary means of supporting the chair and desk. In fact the chassis is not connectable to the upright of a chair, it is the seat which is connected to the chassis. Unlike in Chao where the chassis is a support structure which if removed renders all other features unusable, the chassis of the present invention is used while attached to the desk to the chair which if removed renders only the desk unusable. The instant invention specifically requires a chair which is independently self supporting and thus is a useful object without the present invention.

One of the novel elements of the present invention is the ability to transport, connect, and remove the chassis from the chair without destroying the usefulness of the chair as an independent object. This is accomplished by connecting the appendage to the chair and utilizing the chair for support. This can not be done with the device in Chao. The chassis is the central supporting member.

Therefore, Chao does not teach the novel features in the present invention.

As for the reference to the international application publication for Baru, the seat connector 25, 28 allows the connection of the seat to the chassis. Here as in Chao the seat may not be used independently of the chassis. The chassis is the

means of supporting the seat and the desk as an integral unit. This is not required in the present invention as the chair supports the chassis which in turn supports the desk.

In view of the foregoing amendments and these accompanying remarks, it is respectfully requested that this application be reconsidered.

Therefore, the claims are novel over the prior art and not anticipated or obviated.

It is, therefore, requested that a Notice of Allowance issue and that all of the pending claims be allowed.

Dated: February 6, 2006

Respectfully submitted,

By /Sean Liam Kelleher/  
Bruce E. Lilling  
Reg. No. 27,656  
Sean Liam Kelleher  
Reg. No. 54,212  
Lilling & Lilling P.C.  
Customer No. 24,101  
PO Box 560  
Goldens Bridge, NY 10526  
914-684-0600  
914-684-0304 Fax